Challenges in Collecting and Reporting Race and Ethnicity Data in Establishments: Examples from Two Federal Surveys

Herman A. Alvarado and Kathryn Downey Piscopo
Substance Abuse and Mental Health Services Administration (SAMHSA)

Amy Anderson Riemer and Krysten Mesner
United States Census Bureau

FCSM
October 26, 2023

Any views expressed are those of the authors and not those of SAMHSA, the US Census Bureau or any contractors

SAMHSA
Substance Abuse and Mental Health Services Administration

Agenda

- Introduction: Hybrid Establishment Response Process

- SAMHSA: National Substance Use and Mental Health Services Survey (N-SUMHSS)

- Census: Survey of Sexual Victimization (SSV)

- Lessons Learned from Both Federal Surveys

Purpose

- *How does a revised race and ethnicity question impact establishment data collection and reporting?*

What is your race or ethnicity?
Select all that apply.

☐ White

☐ Hispanic or Latino

☐ Black or African American

☐ Asian

☐ American Indian or Alaska Native

☐ Middle Eastern or North African

☐ Native Hawaiian or Pacific Islander

What is your race or ethnicity?
*Select all that apply **AND** enter additional details in the spaces below. Note, you may report more than one group.*

☐ **WHITE** – *Provide details below.*

| ☐ German | ☐ Irish | ☐ English |
| ☐ Italian | ☐ Polish | ☐ French |

Enter, for example, Scottish, Norwegian, Dutch, etc.

☐ **HISPANIC OR LATINO** – *Provide details below.*

| ☐ Mexican or Mexican American | ☐ Puerto Rican | ☐ Cuban |
| ☐ Salvadoran | ☐ Dominican | ☐ Colombian |

Enter, for example, Guatemalan, Spaniard, Ecuadorian, etc.

☐ **BLACK OR AFRICAN AMERICAN** – *Provide details below.*

| ☐ African American | ☐ Jamaican | ☐ Haitian |
| ☐ Nigerian | ☐ Ethiopian | ☐ Somali |

Enter, for example, Ghanaian, South African, Barbadian, etc.

☐ **ASIAN** – *Provide details below.*

| ☐ Chinese | ☐ Filipino | ☐ Asian Indian |
| ☐ Vietnamese | ☐ Korean | ☐ Japanese |

Enter, for example, Pakistani, Cambodian, Hmong, etc.

☐ **AMERICAN INDIAN OR ALASKA NATIVE** – *Enter, for example, Navajo Nation, Blackfeet Tribe, Mayan, Aztec, Native Village of Barrow Inupiat Tribal Government, Tlingit, etc.*

☐ **MIDDLE EASTERN OR NORTH AFRICAN** – *Provide details below.*

| ☐ Lebanese | ☐ Iranian | ☐ Egyptian |
| ☐ Syrian | ☐ Moroccan | ☐ Israeli |

Enter, for example, Algerian, Iraqi, Kurdish, etc.

☐ **NATIVE HAWAIIAN OR PACIFIC ISLANDER** – *Provide details below.*

| ☐ Native Hawaiian | ☐ Samoan | ☐ Chamorro |
| ☐ Tongan | ☐ Fijian | ☐ Marshallese |

Enter, for example, Palauan, Tahitian, Chuukese, etc.

1. Encoding/Record Formation
   – How is the information collected? (paper, electronic)
2. Respondent Selection/Identification
   – Who is reporting: self or other (proxy)?
3. Assessment of Priorities
   – Are the collection and reporting required for business operations?

4. Comprehension of the Data Request

- Are questions understood as intended?
- Does the establishment have the requested data?

5. Retrieval of Data

- Where is the information stored? (within premises, separate location, cloud?)
- Who has access to the information? (full or limited?)
- Who is required/allowed to report the information?

6. Judging the Adequacy of the Response
    – Is there any missing information?
    – How do we handle "Other" and "Unknown" responses?

7. Reporting the Response
    – Are there any reporting guidelines?

8. Release of the Data
    – Is the data submitted within timeframe?

SAMHSA

The National Substance Use and Mental Health Services Survey (N-SUMHSS)

Methodology for Study

- Two different data collections/universes:
  - Mental health treatment facilities
  - State representatives (behavioral health state agencies)
- Initial contacts: cold calling or emails; used internet searches
- Interview phase: virtual meetings and telephone calls; structured cognitive interview for 30-60 minutes
- Total: 18 interviews (4 in Spanish)
  - 11 state representatives
  - 7 mental health facilities

National Substance Use and Mental Health Services Survey (N-SUMHSS)

- Started in 2021; prior was two separate SAMHSA surveys
  - National Survey of Substance Abuse Treatment Services (N-SSATS)
  - National Mental Health Services Survey (N-MHSS)
- Universe: Facilities providing treatment services
- Collects data on treatment modalities, payment options, age groups accepted, special programs, medical services, clients receiving treatment, and other relevant information
- Information from the N-SUMHSS feeds into SAMHSA's Online Treatment Locator (https://findtreatment.gov/)

National Substance Use and Mental Health Services Survey (N-SUMHSS): Race and Ethnicity Items

2021 results for inpatient (Table MH52b):

- 38.7% Race unknown or not collected;

- 46.7% Ethnicity unknown or not collected

https://www.samhsa.gov/data/sites/default/files/reports/rpt39450/2021%20N-SUMHSS%20Annual%20Detailed%20Tables_508_Compliant_2_8_2023.pdf

Client characteristics	All [1,2]	Psychiatric hospitals	Psychiatric hospitals Public	Psychiatric hospitals Private
Total number of clients	100.0	39.2	16.2	23.0
Gender				
Male	60.6	61.6	73.8	53.1
Female	39.4	38.4	26.2	46.9
Total	100.0	100.0	100.0	100.0
Age				
0-17 years	10.5	13.6	4.0	20.1
18-64 years	79.0	73.9	84.9	66.5
65 years and older	10.5	12.5	11.1	13.4
Total	100.0	100.0	100.0	100.0
Ethnicity				
Hispanic or Latino	7.9	9.2	10.1	8.5
Not Hispanic or Latino		53.9	64.0	46.6
Unknown or not collected	46.7	36.9	25.9	44.9
Total	100.0	100.0	100.0	100.0
Race				
American Indian or Alaska Native	1.5	0.6	0.9	0.4
Asian	3.6	2.2	2.0	2.4
Black or African American	18.1	20.0	25.6	16.1
Native Hawaiian or other Pacific Islander	0.3	0.3	0.4	0.3
White	35.4	39.2	45.9	34.6
Two or more races	2.4	1.7	1.8	1.6
Unknown or not collected	38.7	35.9	23.4	44.7
Total	100.0	100.0	100.0	100.0

Willimack and Nichols (2010)
1. **Encoding / record formation**
2. **Respondent selection / identification**
3. **Assessment of priorities**
4. **Comprehension of the data request**
5. Retrieval of data
6. Judging the adequacy of the response
7. **Reporting the response**
8. Release of the data

Findings: Encoding/Record Formation

- R/E is collected at intake and entered in Electronic Health Record (EHR)

- R/E is not required of clients, sometimes leave this blank or code as "unknown" or "not collected"

- Some facilities will follow-up on other demographics (such as gender) but not R/E

- Also training-related issues when giving clients the demographic forms

- Facilities may allow a proxy (e.g., relative)
- Medical staff may also use other medical charts ("collateral information")

Findings: Assessment of Priorities

- May be of low priority for facilities and there may be issues with satisficing
- One manager said it was "not a good use of our time"

Findings: Comprehension of the Data Request

Select all that apply

- Mixed approach to reporting multiple races by facilities and states
  - Pick one race
  - "2+" category
- Programmed to not allow for more than one race
- If multiple subcategories/examples within a race were checked, would it be classified as multiracial
- Possible combinations to program in a database would be daunting

Differences in terminology
- One did not have a "Native Hawaiian or Other Pacific Islander" category and termed "White" as "Caucasian"
- Sometimes clients want examples for R/E, particularly if they aren't English-speaking
- Had significant issues with the examples/subcategories for the detailed item
- DEIA (diversity, equity, inclusion, and accessibility) experts at the hospital system level provide input on terminology used

Use of "Other"
- "Other" is not included in the proposed R/E items (and is also not in the 1997 Directive), but it is used by facilities
  - Use an "other" category when clients check more than one race

Order of racial categories

- Should be some flexibility in the order of the categories.

Spanish translation

- One facility pointed out the use of "y/o" ("and/or") in Spanish is incorrect
- Spanish is not parallel to the English version

Findings: Reporting the Response

- Many facilities mentioned that they would try to follow the state's data needs
- For federal reporting, they would comply if given guidance

U.S. Census Bureau

Survey of Sexual Victimization (SSV)

Survey of Sexual Victimization (SSV)

- Prison Rape Elimination Act (PREA) – Passed by Congress in 2003
- Sponsored by the Bureau of Justice Statistics (BJS)
- Annual collection on substantiated incidents of sexual abuse and harassment from adult correctional and juvenile justice facilities
- PREA Coordinators are the proxy respondents
- Incidents could involve:
  - Adult inmates (victim or perpetrator)
  - Juveniles (victim or perpetrator)
  - Staff perpetrators
- R/E collected about all victims and perpetrators

Current SSV Race/Ethnicity Question

Victim #1: What was the victim's race/ethnic origin?
(Mark (☐) all that apply.)

- 01 ☐ White *(not of Hispanic origin)*
- 02 ☐ Black *(not of Hispanic origin)*
- 03 ☐ Hispanic or Latino
- 04 ☐ American Indian/Alaska Native *(not of Hispanic origin)*
- 05 ☐ Asian *(not of Hispanic origin)*
- 06 ☐ Native Hawaiian or Other Pacific Islander *(not of Hispanic origin)*
- 07 ☐ Other racial category in your information system – *Specify* ↙

Methodology

- Evaluation of the revised R/E questions was a subset of existing testing happening for the SSV
- Moderated Cognitive Interviews (n=15)
  - Virtual meetings
  - Concurrent probing
- Unmoderated Cognitive Interviews (n=159)
  - 'Web probing'
  - Online questionnaire w/subset of questions
  - Closed and open-ended probes

Willimack and Nichols (2010)
1. **Encoding / record formation**
2. **Respondent selection / identification**
3. Assessment of priorities
4. **Comprehension of the data request**
5. **Retrieval of data**
6. Judging the adequacy of the response
7. **Reporting the response**
8. Release of the data

Findings: Encoding/Record Formation

- Respondents rely entirely on administrative records
- Respondents worked with 2 different record systems:
  - Inmate/Juvenile
  - Staff (often managed by Human Resources)
- Respondents didn't always have access to the systems that contained information about staff perpetrators
  - Must work with Human Resources for this information
- Source of inmate/juvenile R/E
  - Databases/Systems
  - Investigative reports

Findings: Encoding/Record Formation (cont.)

- Systems often do not allow for the collection of multiple race categories (inmate, juvenile, or staff)

- Middle Eastern and Northern African (MENA) categories are not part of the existing record structure (inmate, juvenile, or staff)

- Some facilities have the option of a write-in within records and could potentially extrapolate MENA from this information

- R/E collected:
  - Self-reported during intake
  - Gathered from investigative reports
    - Self-reported or from observation from the detective/officer

- Concerns with the order of categories

- Categories for the minimal version match well with the categories in their systems

  - Respondents would not be able to provide the level of detail requested on the detailed question

- Due to protocol or access, respondents cannot speak directly with the inmate, juvenile or staff member to request R/E data or confirm what is within records

- Many respondents would be open to updating their record systems to be closer to the requested OMB categories in the future

Lessons Learned

- These issues are in addition to any issues related to self-reporting issues found on the household testing
  - Try to test with many types of establishments

- Although respondents want to provide quality data, they are limited by their records
- Respondents are interested in updating their systems

- Minimum
  - It may take extra effort or time for systems to update
  - Issues with reporting 2 or more R/E
- Detailed
  - Records don't have this level of detail
  - Issues with reporting 2 or more R/E
  - Issues with text boxes and mark all that apply
- Establishments have competing priorities and may not find the value of adapting their collection for these revised questions

Thank You

Challenges in Collecting and Reporting Race and Ethnicity Data in Establishments: Examples from Two Federal Surveys

Herman.Alvarado@samhsa.hhs.gov

Kathryn.Piscopo@samhsa.hhs.gov

Krysten.Mesner@census.gov

Amy.E.Anderson.Riemer@census.gov